

**Historic Preservation Commission
Minutes
September 29, 2009**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Sue Dyke, Diane Giles, Don Jensen, Merike Phillips, Judy Rossow, and Tom Schleif

STAFF PRESENT: Mike Maki

The meeting was called to order by Don Jensen, Chairperson, at 5:10 pm and roll call was taken.

Approval of Minutes of September 2, 2009

A motion was made by Ms. Rossow and seconded by Ms. Dyke to approve the September 2, 2009 minutes as submitted. The motion passed unanimously (6 ayes; 0 noes).

1. Certificate of Appropriateness for New Accessory Structure and Amendment to Porch Certificate of Appropriateness for Luther Whitney House, 6104 Third Avenue, Third Avenue Historic District, (District #2). PUBLIC HEARING

Public hearing opened. No public comments. Public hearing closed.

Mike Maki, Planner, said the Commission can defer the items because the owners are not present; split the items and act on the separately; or defer both items.

Mr. Maki said the home is for sale. He received revised drawings for the garage showing further simplification of the patio door on the east elevation. They have simplified the garage to a three-car garage with three (3) garage doors, a service door and windows on the west elevation and a hip roof. The original proposal called for shake shingles. At the previous meeting, the Commission recommended fiber cement board siding which the Heim's are going to use for this project. Mr. Maki said he would recommend approval of the garage.

Mr. Maki said the amendment to the Certificate of Appropriateness for the porch calls for a change to the style of balusters. Italianate style balusters were previously approved. The owners are looking to have the porch resemble a 1927 historic picture. They are asking the Commission for input on the size of the balusters – 2' x 2' or 2' x 3'. Mr. Maki recommends the Commission defer this item.

Ms. Dyke asked why plain columns were installed when the approved Certificate of Appropriateness showed round columns. Mr. Maki said cost was most likely the reason plain square columns were installed. Mr. Maki reminded the Commission that at the last meeting the Heim's had mentioned they had a lawsuit pending with the contractor for the porch. Ms. Dyke asked if it is acceptable that they did not install what was approved. Mr. Maki said they did change the plans. Mr. Maki said his discussion with the owners was to change the balusters on the porch, so he assumed they were going to install columns per the original Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Maki said he does not know what type of columns are currently there.

Mr. Jensen asked the Commission if they wanted to split the two Certificates of Appropriateness. Mr. Schleif said the Commission should split them so the owners can move forward if one of the two items does not get approved.

A motion was made by Mr. Schleif and seconded by Ms. Phillips to act on the two Certificates of Appropriateness separately. The motion passed unanimously (6 ayes; 0 noes).

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Accessory Structure

A motion was made by Mr. Schleif and seconded by Ms. Dyke to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Accessory Structure as presented.

Mr. Schleif asked if the service door on the west elevation will be a flat steel door or if it will be raised. Mr. Maki said the plans show a flat steel door. Mr. Maki noted the flat steel door is preferred over the patio door presented at the previous meeting. Mr. Schleif said he would prefer a panel door for the service door. It would enhance the appearance. Mr. Maki noted that the Commission is only advisory; the owners can do what they wish. Mr. Jensen asked why the Commission is only advisory. Mr. Maki said the way the Commission was set up in the Zoning Ordinance, historic properties have to come before the Commission for any external changes to their property, but they do not have to follow what the Commission recommends. Most of the time, the owners follow the recommendations of the Commission. Mr. Jensen said he is not pleased with the direction the project is going and the fact that the owners can do what they wish regardless of what the Commission recommends.

Mr. Schleif withdrew his motion. Ms. Dyke concurred.

A motion was made by Mr. Schleif and seconded by Ms. Dyke to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Accessory Structure with the stipulation that the service door on the west elevation be a panel door to better match the doors on the home.

Mr. Jensen asked the Commission if they had any additional issues with the garage. Mr. Schleif said the siding issue has been resolved. Mr. Maki noted he did not like the look of the garage doors, but since they were presented at the last meeting and the Commission did not object, he is fine with them. Ms. Dyke asked what type of garage door could be used instead. Mr. Maki said he would have liked to see a carriage style door. Ms. Phillips said the plans do not show any detail on the fascia above the doors. There should be molding or gutters. Mr. Maki said he is not sure if gutters will be installed, but they are not usually shown on plans.

The motion passed unanimously (6 ayes; 0 noes).

Amendment to Porch Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Phillips said the house looks like rough carpentry work has been done, now that it has been painted. The home is lacking in detail. It does not look like the 1927 house in the photograph. It changes the classic style of the building. Detail is very important. Ms. Phillips said she sympathizes with the owners need to get the work done, but to just do the work to get it done is not acceptable. Mr. Jensen concurred. Ms. Phillips said the trellis is nice. Ms. Phillips said on the original plans for the porch, the cornices are different, the balusters are closer together, and the columns are detailed. The top rail should have a slope and rounded or triangular edges. Mr. Schleif asked what the spacing was for the balusters. Mr. Maki said they would have to meet City code for spacing and the top rail. Ms. Phillips said the plans are not drawn to scale. Ms. Phillips said it is to our advantage to have the plans drawn to scale. Mr. Maki said the original plans were drawn by an architect. The owners wanted to double the size the house, but it was too costly. They then started on the porch but ran into contractor issues.

A motion was made by Ms. Dyke and seconded by Mr. Schleif to defer the Amendment to Porch Certificate of Appropriateness pending detailed plans showing detailed design changes to reflect the original design on cornices.

Mr. Jensen asked if it would be better to deny the request than to defer it. Mr. Maki said per the Zoning Ordinance, the Commission has 30 days to review a submittal, but the Commission can defer items for up to six (6) months so it is better to defer an item. Ms. Phillips said since the Heim's are selling the house, maybe the new owners would want to finish the porch correctly. Mr. Maki said the Heim's told him the new owners were concerned that the property was on the Historic Property listing.

The motion passed unanimously (6 ayes; 0 noes).

2. Any Other Business as Authorized by Law

Ms. Phillips said the historic signs for the Third Avenue and Library Park Historic Districts are in need of refurbishing. The printed material and the plexiglass should be replaced. Mr. Maki said they were redone around 1996. The local print shop that did the work is out of business now, but the City does have the proofs. Public Works is responsible for maintaining the signs. Mr. Maki said he would check into this.

3. Public Comments

No public comments.

4. Commissioner Comments

Mr. Schleif said he was forwarded an email that Mike had received from a planner in St. Cloud, MN. They have audio walking tours of their historic districts posted on YouTube, iTunes, etc. Mr. Schleif said he has studio equipment to do this. Mr. Jensen said he did a demo tape for a HarborPark walking tour and for the Third Avenue Historic District years ago. They could possibly be used as a starting point for the new tours. Mr. Schleif said with the technology we have now and access to MP3 players, etc., it would be great to have them available. Mr. Jensen suggested a walking tour for the northside also. Mr. Maki thought this project could possibly be funded through a Humanities Grant.

A motion to adjourn was made by Ms. Giles and seconded by Ms. Phillips. The motion passed unanimously (6 ayes; 0 noes). The meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

Certification that the minutes have been approved by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Jeffrey B. Labahn, Secretary